Unconfirmed minutes of the meeting of Council held on **Wednesday 22 February 2006** in the Council Chamber at the College

**Present:**
- Professor Sir Alan Craft, *President* (Chair)
- Dr Steve Bennett Britton, West Midlands
- Dr Hilary Cass, Registrar
- Dr Ruth Charlton, South West Thames
- Dr Greg Dilliway, Associate Members’ representative
- Dr Paul Dimitri, Trainee representative
- Dr Alun Elias-Jones, *Honorary Treasurer*
- Dr Andrew Evans, South East Thames
- Dr Steve Greene, N, NE, East Scotland
- Dr Patricia Hamilton, *President Elect*
- Dr Sue Hobbs, *Officer for Workforce*
- Dr Ben Ko, North East Thames
- Dr Geoff Lawson, Northern
- Dr Simon Lenton, *Vice President, Health Services*
- Dr Tom Lissauer, *Officer for Examinations*
- Dr Peter MacFarlane, Trent
- Dr Nicholas Mann, Oxford
- Professor Neil McIntosh, *Vice President, Science and Research*
- Dr Mary McGraw, *Vice President, Training & Assessment*
- Dr Ramesh Mehta, East Anglia
- Dr Gwyneth Owen, *Officer for Wales*
- Dr Ruby Schwartz, North West Thames
- Dr Claire Smith, *Donald Court Fellow*
- Dr Sian Snelling, Mersey
- Dr Moira Stewart, Northern Ireland
- Dr Alistair Thomson, *Officer for CPD*
- Dr Jane Tizard, South Western
- Dr Helen Venning, Specialist representative
- Dr Chris Verity, *Vice President, Education*
- Dr Edward Wozniak, Wessex
- Dr Martha Wyles, Trainee representative

**In attendance:**
- Mr Len Tyler, College Secretary
- Mr David Ennis, Head of Committee Department
- Ms Sophie Auckland, Child Participation Manager
- Ms Kim Brown, Education Adviser
- Ms Claire Brunert, Head of Media
- Ms Alix Clark, Head of Training
- Mrs Linda Haines, Principal Scientific Officer
- Mr Graeme Muir, Head of Examinations
- Mr Mike Poole, Head of Finance & Membership
- Miss Rosalind Topping, Head of Education
- Miss Laura Vincent, Head of Human Resources
- Mr Morgan Jamieson, National Clinical Lead for Children and Young People in Scotland
C/06/01 Chairman’s welcome and apologies for absence

The President welcomed the following new Council representatives:

Dr Steve Bennett Britton   West Midlands
Dr Nicholas Mann   Oxford

In addition, the President welcomed Mrs Sally Sweeney Carroll, the new Chair of the Patient and Carers Advisory Group and lay representative on Council.

Apologies for absence were received from Dr Jack Beattie, Dr David Beverley, Dr Iolo Doull, Dr Mark Everard, Professor Denis Gill, Dr Natalie Lyth, Dr Adrian Margerison, Professor Richard Olver, Dr Ian Swann and Dr Peter Sullivan.

The President reported that this was the final Council meeting for the following Officers and members: Dr John Cosgrove, Dr Greg Dilliway, Dr Alun Elias-Jones, Dr Mark Everard, Dr Ben Ko, Dr Margaret Mearns, Dr Moira Stewart, Dr Peter Sullivan and Dr Jane Tizard.

The President, on behalf of Council, thanked the members concerned for all their hard work on behalf of the College and wished them success for the future.

C/06/02 Deaths of members

Council NOTED with regret the deaths of the following members:

Dr Dawn Gail Braude, Associate Member, admitted 1998, Cardiff
Lord Michael Chan, Senior Fellow, admitted 1977, Wirral
Dr Anthony Jackson, Honorary Fellow, admitted 1960, London
Dr Lisa Jean Fisher Jeffes, Ordinary Member, admitted 2003, Bath
Professor Paul Polani, Honorary Fellow, admitted 1957, West Clandon
Dr Ronald Cathcart Roxburgh, Senior Fellow, admitted 1961, King’s Lynn
Sir (Charles) Eric Stroud, Honorary Fellow, admitted 1963, London
Dr Stanley Douglas Victor Weller, Honorary Fellow, admitted 1956, Bath

and the following non-members:

Dr F Peter Capps   Shrewsbury
Mr Robert Swanton   Honorary College Librarian (retired)

Council stood in silent tribute.
C/06/03 Dates of future meetings

Council NOTED:

(a) the next meeting of Council will take place on **Wednesday 5 July 2006**;

(b) the final Council meeting in 2006 will take place on **Wednesday 1 November**.

All meetings are from 10.00am to 4.00pm at the College Office.

C/06/04 Minutes of the last meeting

The unconfirmed minutes of the meeting of Council held on 2 November 2005 were **APPROVED** as a correct record.

C/06/05 Matters arising from the minutes not otherwise covered on the agenda

C/06/05a Minute C/05/52b: CEMACH and Legal Liability for statements in publications

(i) Council RECEIVED a report from Len Tyler that written confirmation had now been received from the Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists that the RCPCH would not be liable for the content of reports and statements produced by CEMACH;

(ii) Len Tyler had also agreed to check with Bertie Leigh whether, if paediatricians made a diagnosis on the basis of the RCP’s Child Sexual Abuse publication, the College would be legally liable. Council NOTED the advice received that, provided paediatricians made a diagnosis on the basis of the best information available at the time, they would not be liable.

C/06/05b Minute C/05/59b: Protocol for investigating suspected instances of cheating in College examinations

Council RECEIVED a progress report from Graeme Muir, Head of Examinations and it was noted that the candidate concerned had been reported to the GMC for cheating. Len Tyler agreed to investigate what action the GMC had taken.

C/06/05c Minute C/05/66d: Memorandum of Understanding with the University of the West Indies

Council RECEIVED a report that Len Tyler had written pointing out that the College had assumed the agreement was with the whole of the University of the West Indies and not just the St Augustine Campus. A response had not yet been received.

C/06/06 Minutes of the RCPCH Executive Committee

Council RECEIVED the unconfirmed minutes of the Executive Committee held on 18 January 2006.
C/06/07  President’s report

Council:

(a) **RECEIVED** a report on a meeting which had taken place with Ms Maria Eagle, Minister for Children at the DfES. The College had requested a statement from the DfES that paediatricians were protected by the law when undertaking child protection work under the provisions of the Children Act (2004) and Working Together and the recent House of Lords judgements. It was hoped to have this statement for the AGM on 5 April when Officers would report back on the action taken in relation to last year’s resolution on mandatory reporting of child protection. The President also referred to the recent judgement in the High Court in the case of Roy Meadow and the General Medical Council, in which Mr Justice Collins had allowed Roy Meadow’s appeal against serious professional misconduct. Mr Justice Collins ruled that Professor Meadow’s actions could not be regarded as serious professional misconduct because “he had acted in good faith”. The GMC should not have brought misconduct proceedings because expert witnesses should be “immune” from prosecution or disciplinary action. This ruling had been welcomed by the College. In addition, the President reported on meetings with Mrs Patricia Hewitt, Secretary of State for Health, to discuss training issues and with Mr Liam Byrne, Minister for Children at the Department of Health, where problems relating to the multiple sources of commissioning for child health services had been raised;

(b) in discussion, it was pointed out that due to the grave financial difficulties being experienced by a number of trusts, children’s services were being seriously affected with bed closures across the United Kingdom for financial reasons. It was **AGREED** that evidence should be collected and that this matter should be discussed at the Policy Conference on ‘Modelling Children’s Services’;

(c) **RECEIVED** reports on meetings of the Academy of Medical Royal Colleges held on 23 January 2006, 12 December and 27 October 2005;

(d) **CONSIDERED** a proposed dissemination strategy for the document on Complaints Research in relation to child protection work which was being produced following the qualitative study by Jackie Turton. Following discussion, Council **AGREED** to delegate formal approval of the document to Executive Committee. The document would be circulated to Council readers who would report to March EC. It was planned to present a paper on the document at the Spring Meeting and circulate either a summary or the whole document with the June College newsletter. EC would take the final decision on whether to circulate the full document to the membership;

(e) **RECEIVED** a report from Dr Patricia Hamilton on the meeting of CESP and the European Board held in Brussels in December 2005. Dr Hamilton outlined the proposal for a European Accreditation Board for revalidation schemes in individual countries. Following discussion, Council **AGREED NOT TO SUPPORT** the College joining the scheme, in principle, on the basis that it would prove too bureaucratic and costly;

(f) **RECEIVED** a report from the President that the College planned to join with a number of other Royal Colleges to set up an action group on smoking. Following the vote by the House of Commons to ban smoking in
public places, which it was hoped would become legislation in 2007, a campaign was now required to protect children from the dangers of passive smoking in the home.

C/06/08  College Work Plan 2006 – 2007

Council CONSIDERED the draft College Work Plan 2006 – 2007. Following discussion, Council AGREED the Work Plan subject to a number of additions and amendments. Council FURTHER AGREED the following:

(a) there was a need for more involvement from College members in the development of the work plan and this could be done through regional representatives;

(b) more time was required at Council for trustees to discuss the work plan and contribute ideas;

(c) a mechanism was therefore required to allow time to be set aside for this discussion, either during an existing meeting or to organise a separate meeting of Council for this purpose.

C/06/09  Restructuring the College

Council CONSIDERED a progress report prepared by Len Tyler on Restructuring the College. Council NOTED that this work was being taken forward by Executive Committee and that proposals for the top level Boards would be presented to July Council.

C/06/10  Training and Assessment

Council:

(a) CONSIDERED the following:

(i) Diagram of the UK MMC Career Framework Proposal;
(ii) Diagram showing the College’s proposals for the run-through grade, exit from the foundation years and models of specialty training;

(b) DISCUSSED the diagrams and made the following points:

(i) in the College diagram, concern was raised about the inter-relationship between academic training and research. Council noted that the Academic Panel was working on a paper on recruitment into academic paediatrics which would be published in the Spring;
(ii) concern was expressed at the term “Senior Medical Appointments” on the MMC diagram. Professor Craft pointed out that there was a huge debate going on at present about the consultant grade; however, the role of the Colleges would be to maintain standards of those achieving CCT;
(iii) the College had been working with other specialties, in particular, general practice. A statement on posts for incorporating into general practice training programmes had been produced, including information on competences. Council AGREED, in principle, to
endorse this work and that it should be submitted to March EC for approval;
(iv) the final phase of this work was the preparation of post-core competences for general paediatrics and the 13 sub-specialties which would need to be submitted to PMETB by June 2006 for approval. Council AGREED to delegate approval of this work, undertaken by College CSACs, to Executive Committee;

(c) RECEIVED an oral report from Dr Mary McGraw on selection into the specialty. It was noted that this process would be the responsibility of the deaneries;

(d) RECEIVED an oral report from Dr McGraw that the College was devising an assessment work programme that would consider competences. An ad hoc working group had been set up which would prepare a proposal for consideration by Executive Committee;

(e) CONSIDERED a report prepared by Dr Claire Smith containing an update on PMETB guidance on approval of posts, trust doctors and visits. Concern was expressed that the new multi-specialty visits being undertaken on behalf of PMETB would not be rigorous enough. A mechanism was required to ensure that education and CPD was of a suitable quality locally to avoid problems developing. It was noted that PMETB would consider allowing Colleges to undertake informal visits and this issue would be discussed by the Academy of Medical Royal Colleges in two weeks time;

(f) RECEIVED an oral report from Dr McGraw that the new Article 14 Committee was being set up. A training day would be held in March and members of the Committee would then begin to undertake assessments.

C/06/11 Health Service Issues

Council RECEIVED a progress report prepared by Dr Simon Lenton on “Modelling for the Future” which was the subject of the Policy Conference on 22 March 2006.

C/06/12 College Projects

Council:

(a) CONSIDERED a proposal prepared by Dr Chris Verity to extend the ‘Child in Mind’ project timeline within the existing budget. The project team was requesting Council to extend the project timeline for six months in order to work towards sustainability, to be funded by the £63,000 which was currently under-spent. Following discussion, Council AGREED to the proposal, in principle, provided the project could be made sustainable in the long term and that a detailed breakdown of how the £63,000 would be spent was provided to the Honorary Treasurer;

(b) RECEIVED information on ‘Safeguarding Children: Recognition & Response in Child Protection – educational programme for doctors in training’ which had been launched in January 2006.
C/06/13 Spring Meeting 2006

Council:

(a) **NOTED** the programme for the meeting;

(b) **APPROVED** the agenda for the Annual General Meeting 2006.

C/06/14 Appointments of Honorary Officers

Council:

(a) **RATIFIED** the appointment of Dr Sue Hobbins as the Honorary Treasurer to serve from April 2006 to 2009;

(b) **ELECTED** Dr Ian Doughty as the Officer for Specialist Training and Dr David Shortland as the Officer for Workforce Planning, both to serve from April 2006 to 2009, following a ballot of Council members present.

C/06/15 Other College appointments

Council:

(a) **NOTED** a report prepared by Len Tyler on the process for the appointment of Overseas Director Posts. Council **APPROVED** the recommendation of the selection board to appoint the following:

- Dr Stephen Allen – Africa
- Dr Michael Webb – South Asia

Council noted that the panel had felt unable to make a recommendation for the Middle East post at present. A further report would be submitted to a future meeting of Council;

(b) **RATIFIED** the following appointments to College Committees:

- Dr Allan Colver – Chair of the BPSU Executive Committee
- Professor Andrew Wilkinson – Chair of the Academic Panel
- Dr Helen Budge – Regional Academic Adviser for Trent South
- Members of the Quality of Practice Committee:
  - Dr Jonathan Evans
  - Dr Martin Kirkpatrick

(c) **NOTED** there were vacancies for Council representatives on the following CSACs: General Paediatrics, Clinical Pharmacology, Immunology and Infectious Diseases, Neonatal and Paediatric Intensive Care which was part of the Intercollegiate Committee on Training in Paediatric Intensive Care Medicine. Council members were requested to contact Dr Hilary Cass if they were interested in taking up one of these posts;

(d) **APPROVED** the appointments of Examiners for MRCPCH and DCH as set out in the report submitted to Council.
C/06/16 Financial matters

Council:

(a) **APPROVED** the Council report and Consolidated Financial Statements for the year ended 31 August 2005;

(b) **APPROVED** the terms of reference for the Paul Polani Fund. Council noted that the fund would be used to encourage work in neurodisability in children and young people;

(c) **RECEIVED** a progress report prepared by Dr Alun Elias-Jones on Medicines for Children and the British National Formulary for Children. Council **NOTED** that the result for the calendar year 2005 just ended was being finalised by the Royal Pharmaceutical Society; draft figures indicated a contribution of £1.5 million which would result in £600k being payable to RCPCH Publications Limited of which £300k was effectively for use by the College. Dr Elias-Jones reported that, when RCPCH Publications Limited was set up, it was proposed to create an academic clinical pharmacologist post with any profits. Council **AGREED** that this should be considered.

C/06/17 Committees and Working Parties

C/06/17a College document: *Implementing the Kennedy Report*

Council:

(a) **CONSIDERED** the draft College document ‘Implementing the Kennedy Report’ together with the comments of a number of Council readers;

(b) in addition, **CONSIDERED** comments from a number of Council members in relation to how the recommendations of the Kennedy Report were being implemented around the country;

(c) **IN DISCUSSION**, the following points were made:

(i) the comments received indicated a level of concern about the home visit and the practicalities of undertaking it;
(ii) there were considerable resource implications for training and support for this work;
(iii) was it appropriate to have a SUDI paediatrician in each district?;
(iv) Safeguarding Boards were to set up Death Review Teams and it was not clear how the Kennedy proposals would fit in; an announcement was awaited;
(v) A child death review was taking place in Northern Ireland and it was agreed that the College should write to the CMO with information about the Kennedy Report;

(d) **AGREED** the following:

(i) **NOT TO SUPPORT** publication of the document until there was clarity over what *Working Together*, to be published by the DfES in March 2006, would recommend with respect to creation of the Child
Death Review Teams and a “Paediatrician with Responsibility for Unexpected Death in Childhood”; 

(ii) To send the comments on the draft College document to Jenny Gray at the DfES who was the lead on the production of *Working Together*. 

C/06/17b  
**Safeguarding Children and Young People: Roles and Competences for Health Care Staff**

Council:

(a) **CONSIDERED** the draft document “Safeguarding Children and Young People: Roles and Competences for Health Care Staff”, together with the comments of a number of Council readers. Council noted that the document had been prepared in liaison with other health care organisations including the RCN and the College was being asked to endorse the document for publication by the Department of Health. Where appropriate, the competences in the document had been cross referenced to the College’s own competency documents;

(b) **IN DISCUSSION**, the following points were made:

(i) flexibility was required in the job descriptions and concerns were expressed about how they would be enforced and monitored;
(ii) the document did not consider the resource implications, which would need to be considered by the Local Children’s Safeguarding Boards;
(iii) concern was expressed that it was not realistic to have a named doctor with 3 nominal PAs allocated and a designated doctor with 5-6 PAs allocated;
(iv) in the model job descriptions there should be more emphasis on the named and designated doctors working closely with nurse colleagues;

(c) **NOTED** that the document contained the current College job descriptions for named and designated doctors. The intention of the document was to set out standards and not to define how training was provided. It was accepted that there were resource issues that needed to be addressed;

(d) **AGREED** to endorse the document, subject to the comments made, and the need to review the College job descriptions for named and designated doctor posts.

C/06/17c  
**Advocating for Paediatricians**

Council:

(a) **CONSIDERED** the draft revised College document ‘Advocating for Paediatricians’ prepared by the Advocacy Committee, together with the comments of the Council readers;

(b) **AGREED NOT TO SUPPORT** the document for publication in its current format and that a revised version should be prepared taking account of all the comments received;
(c) the main points identified were as follows:

(i) the document required editing and some of the advice and examples needed updating;
(ii) the media section required input from the College’s Head of Media;
(iii) consideration should be given to producing the document as a pamphlet with a blank section at the rear for resources and contacts to be added;

C/06/17d Standards for Development of Clinical Guidelines in Paediatrics and Child Health

Council:

(a) CONSIDERED the latest draft of the College document ‘Standards for Development of Clinical Guidelines in Paediatrics and Child Health’, together with the comments of the Council readers;

(b) APPROVED the document for publication, subject to the comments made, which would be incorporated into the document.

C/06/17e Scottish Patient and Carers Advisory Group

Council AGREED the terms of reference of the Scottish Patient and Carers’ Advisory Group.

C/06/17f Scottish Child Protection Court Skills Training Implementation Group

Council:

(a) CONSIDERED a report prepared by Dr Helen Hammond on setting up a Scottish Child Protection Court Skills Implementation Group. The working group would take forward the development of Court Skills training courses;

(b) NOTED that the first Court Skills Training Course for Consultant Paediatricians and Senior Trainees would take place in Edinburgh on 26/27 May 2006, subject to Council’s approval. The Course had been organised jointly with the Faculty of Advocates in Scotland;

(c) APPROVED setting up the Implementation Group and AGREED that the first course should go ahead as planned in May 2006.

C/06/17g Meningitis Research Foundation: Interactive training materials

Council AGREED that interactive training materials produced by the Meningitis Research Foundation, based on a previous document endorsed by the College, could be sent to Council readers to be approved on behalf of Council.
Policy Issues

Council:

(a) **AGREED** the College’s affiliation to SUSTAIN’s lobbying campaign for the Children’s Food Bill;

(b) **CONSIDERED** a report prepared by Dr Alun Elias-Jones about the admission of SASG doctors to MRCPCH. This matter had been considered by Executive Committee at its meeting in January 2006. EC had recommended that the proposal to elect SASG doctors to Ordinary membership should not be progressed further at the current time bearing in mind the current uncertainties surrounding modernising medical careers (MMC). Following discussion, Council did not support EC’s recommendation and **AGREED** the principle that an Associate Specialist or an SCMO, appointed before 1 April 2006, either in paediatrics and child health or in an allied specialty whose work is mainly concerned with child health, would be eligible to apply for full College membership. Council **FURTHER AGREED** that the practicalities should be worked out following the meeting and the appropriate amendment to the Membership Regulations should be prepared for approval at the 2006 AGM;

(c) **CONSIDERED** a paper prepared by Graeme Muir containing a proposal to set up an exams operation in India, and the arguments for and against. A team consisting of Dr Ramesh Mehta (Vice Chair, MRCPCH Part 2 Board & Chair of the British Association of Physicians of Indian Origin), Len Tyler and Graeme Muir had visited India in January and the report summarised the discussions that had taken place in relation to the practicalities of running the examination. In discussion, a number of reservations were expressed about the timing of the proposal given the huge amount of work being undertaken by the College in relation to training and assessment in the UK at present. Following the discussion, Council **AGREED** the following:

(i) that this proposal should be explored further;

(ii) to refer this to the Training and Assessment department for further consideration;

(d) **CONSIDERED** a report prepared by the President on the current review of the Homicide laws in relation to Infanticide, which currently carried a mandatory life sentence, and requesting the views of Council on the questions posed in the consultation document. One of the proposals was to retain infanticide but to give the judge in a particular case the ability to call for psychological and social reports on the mother which might reveal extenuating circumstances and lead to a decision that a mandatory life sentence in a particular case would not be appropriate. In discussion the following points were made:

(i) it was very important to determine the facts and whether there were any extenuating circumstances in each case – the important question was why did the child die;

(ii) the concept of infanticide was outdated and judges must be empowered to obtain reports on the mother;
(iii) children should have equal rights under the law as with any other case;
(iv) it was pointed out that sending the mother to prison for life would not lead to equal rights for any children remaining, who would be deprived of their mother – it was important to find out the reasons for what had happened and provide help and support to parents in these cases;

Council AGREED that the President should prepare an appropriate response on behalf of the College.

(e) AGREED to endorse the document: “A Commitment to Patient Safety” produced by the National Patient Safety Agency.

C/06/19 Management and Building Issues

Council:

(a) CONSIDERED a report prepared by Len Tyler on the College Building Strategy;

(b) AGREED the following:

(i) the College should complete the acquisition of the lease for 56 Hallam Street;
(ii) continue to look for sites for a new building;
(iii) continue to liaise with RCGP and other Colleges to explore the possibility of joint projects.

C/06/20 Membership of the RCPCH

Council:

(a) NOTED and APPROVED applications and nominations for Membership and Fellowship, including Junior and Associate membership;

(b) NOTED current outstanding Membership Subscriptions, Suspensions and Resignations.

C/06/21 Reports for information

Council NOTED the following reports:

(a) Monies awarded and received from outside sources;
(b) Investments;
(c) Legacy Fundraising;
(d) CPD
(e) Workforce planning;
(f) Research Division activities

C/06/22 Minutes

Council RECEIVED the following minutes for information:

(a) Specialty Board: 16 November 2005;
C/06/23  RCPCH Standing Committees and Working Parties

Council RECEIVED the brief reports of College committees, joint committees and working parties held since the last meeting of Council.

Signed: ..........................

Date: .............................